

Why is 'science' as currently conceived often part of the problem, and how it could become part of the solution?

Dr. Ephraim Pörtner, CSS, Switzerland

ENSSER Conference
«Science and policy in times
of multicrisis and dissent»
Athens, 15-17 May 2025



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

From Baconian science...

«Reason has been made a vehicle for domination and death;
it can and must become a vehicle for liberation and life.»
(Val Plumwood 2002, 5)



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Dominant science and its colonial relations

- Modern invention (Cunningham & Williams, 1993)
- Has come to dominate through European colonial and imperial attempts to suppress, discredit, and erase other forms of knowing (Grosfoguel, 2019; Harding, 2008)
- Totalizing: excluding alternative ontologies and epistemologies (Blaser, 2013; Mignolo, 2011)



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Epistemic extractivism

«In the extractivist mindset, the aim is to appropriate traditional knowledge so that transnational corporations can draw up private patents or academics in Western universities can claim to have produced ‘original’ ideas, as if they held the copyright to them. (Grosfoguel 2019, 208).



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Value-neutrality and «irresponsible purity»

«In general, value-neutrality can be a cloak that hides (perhaps even from scientists themselves) values that are so embedded in the folk wisdom of our culture as to be invisible. Researchers who believe they are working within an apolitical value-neutral version of science are, often without any conscious decision at all, simply ignoring the ways in which dominant presumptions frame their questions, or concerns, or goals.» (Risman 2001, 609)



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Value-neutrality and «irresponsible purity»

“Science was often tolerated as a faithful and neutral servant, an engine of economic and military power, blind to politics. Many fields of scholarship did turn out cheering squads for fascism, but just as frightening are the legions of subservients who continued to work quietly, reassured by the myth of cloistered neutrality. Through this lens, the ‘good science’ of the Reich becomes evidence not of heroic ideological innocence but of a blind-eyed failure to reflect and resist ‘irresponsible purity’ in Herbert Mehrtens’s aptly crafted phrase.” (Proctor 2002, 15)



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Uniting Strands of Critical Inquiry: Convivial Sciences

- Grappling with the forces resisting change (both within and beyond the academy)
- *Convivenza*: living together with difference: tolerance of ambiguity and dissonance, active procedures and rituals for disagreeing well
- *Con vivo* (U. Loening): «doing science with awe and humility» as a pathway for intimacy and respect for other beings; a pathway to kinship (Kimmerer, 2013)



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

References

Blaser, Mario. 2013. 'Ontological Conflicts and the Stories of Peoples in Spite of Europe: Toward a Conversation on Political Ontology'. *Current Anthropology* 54 (5): 547–68.

Cunningham, Andrew, and Perry Williams. 1993. 'De-Centring the "Big Picture": The Origins of Modern Science and the Modern Origins of Science'. *The British Journal for the History of Science* 26 (4): 407–32.

Grosfoguel, Ramón. 2019. 'Epistemic Extractivism: A Dialogue with Alberto Acosta, Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, and Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui'. In *Knowledges Born in the Struggle: Constructing the Epistemologies of the Global South*, edited by Boaventura de Sousa Santos and Maria Meneses, 203–18. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429344596>.

Harding, Sandra. 2008. *Sciences from below: Feminisms, Postcolonialities, and Modernities*. Durham/London: Duke University Press.

Kimmerer, Robin Wall. 2013. *Braiding Sweetgrass: Indigenous Wisdom, Scientific Knowledge and the Teachings of Plants*. Minneapolis: Milkweed editions.

Mignolo, Walter. 2011. *The Darker Side of Western Modernity: Global Futures, Decolonial Options*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Plumwood, Val. 2002. *Environmental Culture: The Ecological Crisis of Reason*. London: Routledge.

Proctor, Robert N. 2002. *Blitzkrieg Gegen Den Krebs: Gesundheit Und Propaganda Im Dritten Reich*. Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta.

Risman, Barbara J. 2001. 'Calling the Bluff of Value-Free Science'. *American Sociological Review* 66 (4): 605–11. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3088926>.



Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Ephraim Pörtner & Tamara Lebrecht

Towards Convivial Sciences

Uniting Strands of
Critical Inquiry

Critical Scientists Switzerland (Ed.)

 oekom
science


Critical
Scientists
Switzerland

Check out our new podcast

BEYOND THE FIX



The belief that science and technology can fix all our problems is widespread - but is it justified? The Beyond the Fix podcast offers a deep dive into commonly proposed fixes to the challenges we face today in areas such as climate, energy, economics, agriculture, food and human health.

